



Consultative Committee meeting

Tuesday 29th May 2018 at 7pm at The Royal Lion Hotel

Lyme Regis

Minutes of the meeting

Present

Tim Glover, Blue Marine Foundation (Chair)
Mandelai Wolfe, Project Coordinator/Committee Secretary
Charles Clover, Blue Marine Foundation
Morven Robertson, Blue Marine Foundation
Catherine Whitley, Blue Marine Foundation
Rowena Taylor, Blue Marine Foundation
Adam Rees, Plymouth University
Luke Holmes, Plymouth University
Vicki Gravestock, Southern IFCA
Sarah Clark, Devon and Severn IFCA
Martin Sutcliffe, FLAG
Andrzej Narożanski, Natural England
Mike Spiller, Angling Trust
Terri Portmann
Allen Dowse, Fisherman, Axmouth
Aubrey Banfield, Fisherman, West Bay
Barry Trevitt, Fisherman, Lyme Regis
Bob Carless, Fisherman, Axmouth
Dave Sales, Fisherman, West Bay
Dave Hancock, Fisherman, Axmouth
Gavin Ziemann, Fisherman, Axmouth
Jamie Smith, Fisherman, West Bay
John Wallington, Fisherman, Axmouth
John Worswick, Fisherman, West Bay
Kieran Perree, Fisherman, Lyme Regis
Matt Toms, Fisherman, West Bay
Nigel Birt, Fisherman, Axmouth
Nigel Hill, Fisherman, Lyme Regis
Oscar Fearnley-Derome, Fisherman, Axmouth
Paul Godfrey, Fisherman, Beer
Phil Abrahams, Fisherman, Axmouth
Robert King, Fisherman, Lyme Regis
Virgil Turner, Fisherman, Lyme Regis

1. Apologies

Clare Brook, Blue Marine Foundation
Martin Attrill, Plymouth University
Emma Sheehan, Plymouth University
Angus Walker, Fisherman, Axmouth



James Newton, Fisherman, Beer
John Shuker, Fisherman, Lyme Regis
Mark Dack, Fisherman, Lyme Regis
Gerry Irwin, MMO
Michael Coyle, MMO
Robert Clark, Southern IFCA
Sam Dell, Southern IFCA
Simon Pengelly, Southern IFCA
Jerry Percy, LIFE
Grahame Forshaw, West Dorset District and Weymouth Council
Richard Caslake, Seafish
Laky Zervudachi, Direct Seafoods
Lukasz Kalinowski, Direct Seafoods
Peter Tinsley, Dorset Wildlife Trust
Ken Buchan, Dorset County Council

2. Minutes of last meeting

The minutes from the last meeting held on 5th December 2017 were approved.

3. Updates

A) BLUE update

Charles Clover gave a short update from BLUE. He acknowledged the issues aspects of the scheme including Reserve Seafood are having but that BLUE has been working hard to review and find a way forward. Following a fisherman's meeting earlier in the evening a way forward has been found and there should be a solution within the next few weeks.

He also noted the recently completed Potting Study was a great selling point for the Reserve. It shows a sweet spot between fishing and conservation – first noticed by Dave Sales and proves that this model can produce benefits for all. Once published, BLUE will launch a social media campaign to support it.

B) Marine authorities and agencies

Sarah Clark updated the group on behalf of D&SIFCA. The roll out of iVMS for all mobile vessels over 12m should be underway by the end of July. One of the three MMO type approved suppliers has dropped out: Echomaster leaving just AST and Succorfish remaining. DEFRA is also set to launch a consultation on a statutory instrument for iVMS on all English registered vessels to support a fully monitored fishery. This will include 10m and under vessels.

Sarah noted that the D&SIFCA netting bylaw came through on the 1st of March. This requires anyone who nets within the district to get a permit. Under the bylaw estuaries have been closed to netting.

The D&SIFCA bylaw sub committee is working on permit changes that include a minimum landing size increase for whelk from 55mm to 65mm following extensive research into sexual maturity patterns and population dynamics. This should come into place in a years time. Rob King asked about a rumor of a maximum landing size of 70mm. Vicki Gravestock said SIFCA have also heard about this rumor but that neither IFCA were considering it as a measure. John Worswick asked Sarah if D&SIFCA were considering pot limits for whelks, as SIFCA has consulted the fishermen in their district and received positive feedback. Sarah said it was not currently on the table but if it was



something fishermen wanted it could be assessed and easily brought in under a bylaw. She also said that they did not set a riddle size or specification as most fishermen set up differently but that the length x width science D&SIFCA have done to translate shell lengths to widths has informed this.

Tim Glover reminded the committee that BLUE have commissioned MRAG to conduct a national review of the management and fisheries for whelk and cuttlefish and make recommendations for management. The report should be available within the next few months. Nigel Hill asked why there can't be a closed season for whelk to prevent the stock being hammered – this could be 3 months long. Sarah said that D&SIFCA have considered it but there are big differences between the South and West coast fisheries. Interestingly the West coast fishery is high value and continues throughout the year. Nigel noted that there is a lot of tonnage coming out in Lyme and it is at risk of being wiped out. Barry Trevitt agreed and said that this was the reason SIFCA were looking into a pot limit to stop Brixham boats who fish with up to 3 to 4 thousand pots. Aubrey Banfield reminded the committee that even with a closed season and pot limit Brixham boats could not be stopped as they fish outside the 6 mile limit and would not be subject to these bylaws. Terri Portman mentioned Cefas have done extensive work across several IFCAs to support a national minimum landing size.

Sarah asked the fishermen if catches for cuttlefish were low as they had seen hardly any around. Fishermen agreed. D&SIFCA have also been doing a small-scale trial to test different media around pots to allow eggs to hatch. Dave noted that under the LBFCR code of conduct fishermen have agreed to leave eggs on pots and move them to sheltered area until they have hatched. Aubrey however said that fishermen have always and will always wash eggs off but that it is the trawlers targeting small cuttle for the market in China that is causing the issue. Trawlers mainly target small cuttle between November to December. Many agreed this is having an impact on the fishery this year. Rob mentioned trawlers for cuttle have made a mess inside the mussel farm at Sidmouth. There are also boats coming down from Fraserburgh and Peterhead to target cuttle. Sarah reminded the group that if they see something illegal to please report it.

Vicki then gave a short update on behalf of SIFCA. A letter was sent out on the 29th of March to gather views on their inshore potting review. This is a call for information stage and follows the bylaw review which revealed there may be a need for additional measures in some areas. SIFCA are looking for views on cuttlefish, whelk, crab and lobster. The consultation ends on June 29th.

Action: BLUE to make available the MRAG report when ready.

C) Natural England

Andrzej gave an update on behalf of Natural England and said regarding the Statutory Instrument issue - a 4.56km box that is inside the SI but outside SIFCAs BTFG byelaw that is being proposed for removal and opened up to towed gear – due to Brexit the whole thing has been parked. Once NE hear anything back from Defra they will inform the committee.

D) Recreational angling

Mike Spiller reported that the recreational angling community of Lyme Bay continue to see recovery of marine life and are working hard to promote it. He asked if Rowena and the BLUE team could provide some more leaflets for them to use.

Last week a local angler posted some very positive feedback on BLUE's Facebook account and it has been shared across all platforms. Charles read out the feedback sent in by Steven who owns Ollie the boat in Axmouth.



Mike also said he was due to meet with BLUE in the coming days to discuss how they can help gather important data whilst out angling.

Action: Rowena to provide Mike with leaflets.

Action: BLUE to meet with Mike and discuss data collection opportunities with anglers in Lyme Bay.

E) Local Coordinator

Tim introduced Mandy to the committee as BLUE's new South West Coordinator. Mandy thanked the group and said she was thrilled to be onboard. She gave a special thank you to the fishermen for accepting her and helping her settle in and felt there was already a strong relationship building.

F) Chiller Stores

Tim reported that all four chiller units were now up and running. Rob King however said that for the last week there had been an issue with the Lyme Regis chiller overheating. Although Paul Creed from SPX had been out to reset it before it has continued to cut out. This could be an issue with the tempering machine or ventilation system. Rob agreed to speak to SPX with Mandy and sort the issue out.

Action: The Lyme Regis Chiller group to liaise with Mandy and Paul from SPX to solve the issue.

G) iVMS/App

Morven Robertson gave an update on the progress of transitioning boats from the old Succorfish units to a new system based on an app developed by AST. The GAP Lone Worker app will operate using a geofence around the Reserve and so only when fishermen are actively fishing will it record and send data to a portal managed by BLUE. BLUE hopes an app system will provide a cost effective and low maintenance solution and allow data to be recorded on fishing patterns whilst supporting the needs of Reserve Seafood. A BLUE team workshop is planned within the next few weeks and a fishermen's workshop will follow shortly afterwards. This will allow fishermen to learn how to use the app and explore the add on features it can provide.

AST are one of the MMO type approved suppliers although the App itself is not type approved. Vicki and others asked how this fits into the DEFRA consultation on iVMS for all boats. Tim noted that the consultation and implementation could take a while and the app will allow BLUE to continue to gather data and underpin Reserve Seafood. Vicki noted the grant for the DEFRA proposal has been approved by EMFF.

Action: BLUE to facilitate AST workshop for fishermen and the installation of apps on all phones.

Action: BLUE to speak to DEFRA re consultation plans.

H) Reserve Seafood

Tim said that BLUE and the fishermen had worked hard over the last few months to find a way forward with the Direct Seafood partnership but due to changes in the business and the volumes of certain species caught by fishermen they were finding it hard to accommodate the scheme. BLUE is awaiting a final response but has in the meantime been exploring other options including Plymouth Trawler Agents and Sole of Discretion. This has been discussed at length with fishermen before the meeting and at a meeting two weeks before and there seems to be an agreed consensus on the way forward. BLUE will also invest in some marketing for the brand to help promote it.



I) Schools Outreach Programme

Rowena Taylor updated the committee on the progress of the Schools Outreach Programme. The target for this academic year 2017/18 of 40 sessions will be exceeded by the end of term with 47 sessions. Since 2012 when Dave Sales led the initiative we have done 151 schools which equates to 6,746 students engaged. Due to the departure of Neville however we have had to turn down some visits due to capacity issues. However, Gavin has done an amazing job. Gavin said that it has been an education for him in the way teachers, students and class room helpers view fishermen and their perceptions of issues such as litter in the marine environment. "I have found it very rewarding to teach those who do not have the opportunity as I did to interact with the fishing community at a young age". Adam Rees has also continued to be an ambassador for the project and presented to the whole of year 9 at Thomas Hardy again this year - roughly 200 students.

Morven touched briefly on the status of funding. The FLAG have agreed to let BLUE rejig its proposal as Neville left and are looking to fund a full time Schools Outreach Manager to support ambassadors and develop materials across BLUE's other projects.

Action: Those interested in becoming an ambassador should contact Rowena

Action: BLUE to rejig and submit FLAG application to support the project.

J) FLAG

- Martin Sutcliffe reported that the FLAG has committed 50% of available funds (just over £300,000) to projects. One project has been completed and nine have had offer letters issued with others at various stages. Some priorities are now at capacity but others including priority 2: strengthen the aquaculture sector in Dorset
- and 4: enable innovation to increase the value of catch and products and have large amounts still available so please get in touch if there is a potential project.

K) Codes of Conduct review

Tim reminded the committee that the LBFCR codes of conduct should be reviewed annually. At the last meeting a maximum landing size for lobster was tabled but has not received much feedback. The committee discussed that given there is no consensus within the Reserve on a minimum landing size an upper would be difficult to implement. Sarah suggested that the code could adopt a minimum landing size of 90mm. This is a measure that has worked for D&SIFCA and Sarah is happy to share the data. Some fishermen that fish within the SIFCA district said this would not work for them. It was agreed a maximum landing size for lobster would not be pursued further.

Action: Sarah to share lobster data with BLUE.

4. Skates and rays research

The issues Reserve Seafood and BLUE have had with certain species including thornback ray due to the MCS rating were discussed. Tim has been in discussion with MCS over their ratings for several years and the current 5 rating for ray is causing issues for fishermen. To support them BLUE has decided to fund research into the population and fishery in Lyme Bay. The research proposal has been put together with input from Cefas, Plymouth University, the IFCAs and Natural England and MCS themselves. MCS have agreed that if the data is positive they will re-rate the fishery.



Catherine Whitley is starting phase 1 this week which will include a desk-based literature review and interviews with Reserve fishermen targeting rays. Tim asked if all fishermen who target the species could help Catherine and provide information. Some fishermen noted that netting for ray has stopped until late August due to the spider crabs.

Action: BLUE to send D&SIFCA the proposal to review

Action: Catherine to undertake a series of face to face interviews with Reserve fishermen.

5. Potting Study consultation

The Potting Study is now complete and the report was sent out to the committee for review six weeks ago. Adam gave a brief overview of the results. This is the first time a threshold has ever been seen for different levels of potting and showed that at the highest level of potting a decrease in certain reef species was observed. The project has had some important outputs demonstrating that fishermen can be involved in science and that the current levels of potting within the Reserve are sustainable. This report should provide the evidence and clout to support what the Reserve and fishermen are doing at present and make the case to continue doing so. BLUE and Adam now need feedback before the final submission to DEFRA. Tim reminded everyone that it is owned by DEFRA. Adam opened up the floor to questions. Dave reported that he was unhappy with the foreword written by BLUE as it failed to capture the history of the MPA before BLUE. Recognition is needed for the work by fishermen and work before 2012. Tim reminded Dave that this research focused on the Reserve at present. Charles suggested Dave should supply a few sentences that could be included.

Aubrey referred to the damage seen at high levels of potting to certain species and said the context for this needed to be clearer within the report. Adam said that if exposed to the highest level of potting – a level much higher than what anyone was currently fishing at in the Reserve – it showed there was a decline for two species. He also noted that this study took place over three and a half years on the same piece of ground, so is not replicable to normal conditions. Aubrey and others said if this is the case then it needs to be clearer in the report as there are fears that this could be turned around and used against them. This concern reported by fishermen has been made worse due to what happened with the bass report. Adam agreed to review the wording. Terri added that the fear is that as pink sea fans caused the closure to mobile gear that if this study shows potting is detrimental to pink sea fans then Natural England and others would have statutory obligations to act. Vicki agreed that if the report shows there is damage they would have to act not only in Lyme Bay but other areas too – at present they use up to date literature in assessments and none point towards potting being damaging. Tim said that the codes ensure potting never reaches the high level used in the report however if there is any doubt then the language must make it clear that this was an experimental treatment higher than current levels of potting in Lyme Bay.

The committee discussed Figure 1.4 that showed a dramatic decrease for two individual species, however Adam said that many other individual species were looked at and the majority did not show this pattern. NE and the IFCAs said that it would be helpful to have the raw data.

Vicki asked Adam how he teased apart the impact of potting and the adverse weather a few years ago during the storms. Aubrey asked Adam whether or not static footage was taken of crabs eating corals – natural processes like this happen all the time and are not monitored. Adam explained that this study took place post the winter storms of 2013/2014 and that all treatments at that time represented a post storm ecological baseline. Treatments showed similar levels of the variables measured at this time, and that a key part of the ecological design is to make sure all treatments are similar from the offset. By ensuring this, as well as incorporating controls into the design, we can



have confidence that any changes we are seeing are related to potting and not other factors as this would be seen across the other treatments and within the controls otherwise.

Charles reminded everyone that the report has proved that the low levels of potting carried out by fishermen in the Reserve through the code are sustainable. This is a valuable resource for fishermen.

Terri then asked BLUE what the options were for carrying on this data. Were there plans to keep them closed and continue to collect data? Dave Hancock said that from his point of view there were to be no closed areas. Adam noted that March 2017 was the last time data was collected and so Plymouth University would like to continue this and strengthen the data set. Dave said that the areas had since been fished and peoples gear had been seen recently inside. It was agreed that all four ports need to have a discussion re the continuation of the study within the no potting zones closed areas. Vicki asked what the benefit would be of keeping the areas closed. Tim said to turn it on its head if in three years the IFCA wanted to limit potting this data would allow fishermen to fight their corner. BLUE are willing to fund ongoing monitoring.

Sarah asked Adam if he quantified the level of effort, pots per square kilometer and Adam confirmed that this had been done and that the densities were included within the report.

Andrzej said there is great value in a long term monitoring study and that NE go back to the one in Lyme Bay every year. There would be a great benefit in continuing this for as a long as possible and enable fishermen to prove a point.

Action: Dave Sales to supply BLUE with some words for the foreword.

Action: Fishermen to discuss within ports re the continuation of the no potting areas.

Action: Adam to review wording within the report and adjust based on discussions.

Action: All comments and edits must be submitted to Adam by Friday the 8th of June. Mandy can be a port of contact for those who do not have Adam's contact details.

6. Future management plan

The need for an update on the future management of the Reserve was requested by Angus Walker Tim reported. There is a lot to consider about how we manage the Reserve long-term and continue monitoring and the funding of this in a sustainable way. Tim suggested that a small sub-committee is created to draft out and guide future management. Those interested in being represented should inform BLUE. NE and D&SIFCA informed the committee that they would want to be represented. Vicki noted that SIFCA have secured funding to work towards management plans for MPAs within their district including Lyme Bay and that it would make sense to collaborate. Tim agreed and suggested that the lead on the SIFCA MPA initiative should sit on the sub-committee.

Action: Committee members to inform BLUE if they would like to join the sub-committee.

7. Coastal P.O

Tim gave background on discussions with Coastal PO. BLUE was approached by them to discuss possible collaboration within Lyme and elsewhere. They came from the perspective of being able to add something to Lyme, management of chiller stores and look at how we were selling the catch etc. They represent inshore fishermen and have a seat at the table for quota, DEFRA and other important meetings. They have members here however Rob said that since paying £1 they have not heard anything in about two years. Despite this Rob and others agreed they would like to hear more from them and see a proposal. Aubrey raised concerns stating they had not achieved anything since their creation several years ago and does not feel they will bring anything useful to the project. Terri said



that other fishermen around the UK were also divided on opinion. It was agreed that BLUE would ask the Coastal PO to come to the next meeting and present to the committee. Before this BLUE will also ask for an outline proposal of what they feel they can contribute.

Action: BLUE to invite the Coastal PO to present to the committee and produce an outline proposal.

8. Communications

Rowena informed the group that we will be taking part in Dorset Seafood Festival 14th and 15th of July again this year. We will be supplying Reserve Seafood directly to the three demo stages and the BLUE team will be on hand to brief all chefs and promote the Reserve and catch. – we are going to do the Dorset seafood festival again this year. We are going to supply three demo stages this year. Chefs will be cooking with Reserve Seafood, they will be briefed over the course of the two days. Social media continues to be strong with over 2000 followers on Twitter and 1180 followers. Please continue to send videos, news and images to info@lymebayreserve.co.uk

9. Media and PR

Charles said that once the Potting Study is published BLUE will want to produce a video. This will be reviewed and approved by the committee.

Luke Holmes reminded the committee of the annual surveys Plymouth University carries out within the Reserve. Throughout the winter video footage has been analysed and is impressive in terms of species diversity and recovery. A focus of this work includes the recovery from storms and they are looking for information on the Beast from the East. This years monitoring is set to start on 25th.

10. AOB

No AOB raised.

11. Date of next meeting

The next meeting will take place in September. BLUE will issue a date nearer the time and Mandy will ensure the date does not clash with the FLAG meeting.